EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

1. The following is a summary of the outcome of Stage 2 Public Engagement (PE) exercise for the West Kowloon Cultural District (WKCD), prepared by the Public Policy Research Institute (PPRI) of The Hong Kong Polytechnic University.

Stage 2 PE Exercise

2. Stage 2 PE exercise was conducted from 20 August to 20 November 2010. During the PE exercise, the West Kowloon Cultural District Authority (WKCDA) presented three Conceptual Plan Options to the public. The three Conceptual Plan Options are: "City Park" designed by Foster + Partners ("CP"), led by Lord Norman Foster; "Cultural Connect: Key to Sustained Vitality" designed by Rocco Design Architects Limited ("CC"), led by Mr. Rocco Yim; and "Project for a New Dimension" designed by The Office for Metropolitan Architecture ("PND"), led by Mr. Rem Koolhaas. The public and stakeholders were asked to comment on: (1) the extent to which the Conceptual Plan Options have addressed the mainstream comments on planning aspects received in Stage 1 PE exercise; (2) the individual features of each Conceptual Plan Option; and (3) the phasing of Core Arts and Cultural Facilities and the type of additional facilities.

3. A total of 27 public engagement events was organised, comprising one Youth Forum, five Public Forums, 15 Focus Group Meetings/Forums and six other meetings/forums. The public and stakeholders who participated in the forums and focus group meetings gave views and suggestions on the individual features of each Conceptual Plan Option from both the professional and users' perspectives.

4. In addition, a questionnaire survey was conducted to collect views regarding key planning aspects that are fundamental to the selection of the preferred Conceptual Plan, as well as to solicit views on the phasing of Core Arts and Cultural Facilities and the type of additional facilities.

Questionnaire Survey

5. The Questionnaire comprises four parts: (1) the extent to which the Conceptual Plan Options have addressed the mainstream comments on planning aspects received in Stage 1 PE exercise; (2) the individual features of each Conceptual Plan Option; (3) the phasing of Core Arts and Cultural Facilities and the type of additional facilities; and (4) the demographic characteristics of the respondents.

6. In addition to the collection of completed self-returned questionnaires, PPRI also conducted face-to-face exit poll interviews with visitors to the roving exhibitions.

7. In the event of discrepancies of results amongst the 2 data sets (Self-returned vs Exit Poll), it would be reasonable to give greater weighting to results of the Exit Poll, as over 2,000 respondents were selected on a randomised basis, and all of the respondents had the benefit of seeing the exhibition materials right before answering the questions.

Material Analysed

8. Materials analysed include records of the above-mentioned PE events, written submissions, completed questionnaires, emails, letters, faxes, online discussions and media reports. A total of 7,948 documents, including 7,310 questionnaires, was analysed.

9. Written comments collected from the 7,948 documents were content analysed and subsequently organised into "text units" – a phrase, a sentence or a sequence of sentences representing a point made by the respondent – and were grouped under 9 themes, 42 categories and 161 sub-categories. The coding process involves a review by a different researcher. For sub-categories involving classifying text units into "Positive Views", "Negative Views" and "Other Views", the process involves a further round of audit.

10. A total of 27,314 text units was recorded. This constitutes the qualitative data set. All "text units" were entered into a qualitative data analysis software for indexing and analysis. The quantitative data set comprises answers to the structured questions in the questionnaires, and were summarised as average scores and their associated standard deviation.

Flagged Cases

11. PPRI was alerted to the fact that five batches of completed self returned questionnaires, plus two individually sent, totaling 629, were received via mail during the period 15-23 November 2010. These completed questionnaires have the following common features: (a) photocopies of the questionnaire (not the printed version distributed by the WKCDA) were used; (b) most of them do not provide demographic information; (c) all except 25 do not provide written comments; (d) the responses appear to be similar[1]. A special Committee from PPRI was set up to look into these cases. In view of the lack of restriction on the format and mode of submitting questionnaires, which is common for public engagement exercises, the Committee is of the opinion that there is insufficient evidence to invalidate these

---

1. The questionnaires concerned have marginally increased the average scores of a particular Conceptual Plan Option for all the questions, and also the average score of another Conceptual Plan Option in the aspect of Hotel, Office and Residential Facilities.

cases, even though (i) statistical tests show that the responses from these batches are significantly different from the rest of the responses for all of the questions in the questionnaire, and (ii) the average score for a particular Option is higher for all of the questions with the inclusion of these cases. The Committee decided that these cases need to be flagged, and that the results should be presented with and without the flagged cases (see **Annex 4)**. While the inclusion of these cases have resulted in an increase in the average score of a particular Option for all questions, the rank order of the Options remains unchanged for 9 out of 13 items. The inclusion of flagged cases does not change the results in any significant manner for the distribution of the qualitative data.

Issues Most Widely Discussed

12. Qualitative analysis of text data indicates that the "Overall Design" theme is most widely discussed, with a total of over 6,886 text units of comments (25.2% of total), followed by the "Most Preferred Features" theme, and the "Essential Features" theme with over 6,791 text units (24.9% of total) and 4,697 text units of comments (17.2% of total) respectively. In contrast, the "Accessibility", "Phasing Arrangement for Core Arts and Cultural Facilities", "Addressing Issues raised in Stage 1 PE", "Other Arts and Cultural Facilities and Education-related Facilities", and "Connectivity" themes received 695 (2.5% of total) to 2,527 text units of comments (9.3% of total).

13. Categories receiving over 1,000 text units of comments include:

Category Code	Category	Number of Text Units	Percentage of Total Number of Text Units
6.1	Most Preferred Particular Features - "City Park"	2,177	8.0%
6.2	Most Preferred Particular Features - "Cultural Connect: Key to Sustained Vitality"	2,059	7.5%
2.1	Overall Design - "City Park"	2,025	7.4%
6.3	Most Preferred Particular Features - "Project for a New Dimension"	2,021	7.4%
2.3	Overall Design - "Project for a New Dimension"	1,945	7.1%
2.2	Overall Design - "Cultural Connect: Key to Sustained Vitality"	1,666	6.1%
3.2	Core Arts & Cultural Facilities - "Cultural Connect: Key to Sustained Vitality"	1,289	4.7%
3.4	Hotel, Office and Residential Facilities	1,273	4.7%
2.4	Other Views on Overall Design and Other Aspects of Conceptual Plan Options	1,250	4.6%
3.1	Essential Features - Open Space	1,116	4.1%

The Three Conceptual Plan Options

Addressing the Main Concerns from Stage 1 Public Engagement Exercise

14. **Exhibiting a Green Setting:** The rank order of the average score for the three Options is: CP, CC, PND from all quantitative data sets. The average score for the three Options in descending order is: CP [4.23], CC [3.66], PND [3.26] from the Exit Poll. This is corroborated by the highest frequency counts of positive comments from the qualitative data for CP (103) (CC-32, PND-20). Frequency counts of their respective negative comments are: CP-48, CC-37, PND-36. Preferred features of CP include ample trees and ample public open space.

15. **Environmental Friendliness:** The rank order of the average score for the three Options is: CP, CC, PND from all quantitative data sets. The average score for the three Options in descending order is: CP [3.99], CC [3.59], PND [3.22] from the Exit Poll. This is corroborated by the highest frequency counts of positive comments from the qualitative data for CP (56) (CC-20, PND-5). Frequency counts of their respective negative comments are: CP-13, CC-8, PND-18. Preferred features of CP include good ventilation of the design, underground roads, and the automated people mover.

16. **Showcasing Hong Kong's Unique Local and Traditional Characteristics:** The rank order of the average score for the three Options is: PND, CC, CP from all quantitative data sets. The average score for the three Options in descending order is: PND [3.78], CC [3.61], CP [2.87] from the Exit Poll. This is corroborated by the highest frequency counts of positive comments from the qualitative data for PND (76) (CC-37, CP-3). Frequency counts of their respective negative comments are: PND-17, CC-7, CP-23. Preferred features of PND include the down-to-earth, local and Chinese flavour design.

17. **Experiencing a Relaxing Atmosphere:** The rank order of the average score for the three Options is: CP, CC, PND from all quantitative data sets. The average score for the three Options in descending order is: CP [4.03], CC [3.74], PND [3.47] from the Exit Poll. This is corroborated by the relatively high frequency counts of positive comments from the qualitative data for CP (14) (CC-7, PND-5) even though the counts are low and close to each other. Frequency counts of their respective negative comments are: CP-1, CC-6, PND-4. Preferred features of CP include relaxing and comfortable feel of the design.

18. **Providing Public Open Space:** The rank order of the average score for the three Options is: CP, CC, PND from all quantitative data sets. The average score for the

three Options in descending order is: CP [4.02], CC [3.85], PND [3.68] from the Exit Poll. The order is the same for the two questions on public open space. The number of positive comments from the qualitative data for CP, CC, and PND is close (CP-10, CC-15, PND-5). Frequency counts of their respective negative comments are: CP-4 CC-4, PND-7. Preferred features of CP include the spaciousness, facilitating outdoor cultural activities and providing a downtown place for relaxation. For CC, they include the harbour feature and the orderly arrangement of the open space.

19. **Connectivity with the Neighbouring Districts:** There is no convergence of results for the question on connectivity with the neighbouring districts. The average score for the three Options in descending order is: PND [3.76], CC [3.75], CP [3.53] from the Exit Poll. The rank order for the Self-returned Questionnaire Survey is CP [3.64], PND [3.60], CC [3.54]. If the flagged cases are excluded, the ranking is PND [3.73], CC [3.66], CP [3.58]. The number of positive comments from the qualitative data set is low for all three Options (CC-7, CP-3, PND-1). Frequency counts of their respective negative comments are: CC-6, CP-6, PND-3. There is no convergence of data. The results should be regarded as inconclusive.

20. **Catering the Needs of Different Users:** The rank order of the average score for the three Options is different from the different quantitative data sets. The Exit Poll shows that CC is the preferred Option [CC-3.72, PND-3.68, CP-3.51]. The Self-returned Questionnaire Survey shows that CP is the preferred Option [CP-3.61, PND-3.51, CC-3.47]. If the flagged cases are excluded, PND is the preferred Option [PND-3.67, CC-3.60, CP-3.57]. The number of positive comments from the qualitative data is low for all three Options (PND-11, CP-4, CC-1). Frequency counts of their respective negative comments are: PND-2, CP-3, CC-1. There is no convergence of data. The results are inconclusive.

Degree of Liking for the Essential Features

21. **Providing Public Open Space:** The rank order of the average score for the three Options is: CP, CC, PND from all quantitative data sets. The average score for the three Options in descending order is: CP [3.87], CC [3.77], PND [3.50] from the Exit Poll. The order is the same for the similar questions on addressing public concerns regarding public open space. The number of positive comments from the qualitative data for CC and CP is close (CC-126, CP-122) and much higher than that for PND (61). Frequency counts of their respective negative comments are: CC-72, CP-77, PND-64. Preferred features of CP include spaciousness, facilitating outdoor cultural activities and providing a downtown place for relaxation. For CC, they include the harbour feature and the orderly arrangement of the open space.

22. **Core Arts and Cultural Facilities:** The rank order of the average score for the three Options is different from the different quantitative data sets. The Exit Poll shows that CC is the preferred Option [CC-3.79, PND-3.74, CP-3.55], while the Self-returned Questionnaire Survey shows CP as the preferred Option [CP-3.70, PND-3.60, CC-3.53]. If the flagged cases are excluded, PND is the preferred Option [PND-3.72, CP-3.63, CC-3.62]. The qualitative data set indicates that PND received the most number of positive comments (173), followed by CC (135), and CP (76). Frequency counts of their respective negative comments are: PND-123, CC-106, CP-125. Preferred features of CC include its integration with public space, the local character, and the location of the Xiqu Centre. Preferred features of PND include its overall layout or design, M+, Premiere Theatre, and Black Box Theatre.

23. **Retail, Dining and Entertainment Facilities:** No significant difference is observed in terms of preferences from the Exit Poll [CC-3.63, PND-3.62, CP-3.60]. The average score in descending order from Self-returned Questionnaire Survey is CP [3.74], PND [3.49], CC [3.42]. If the flagged cases are excluded, the rank order is CP [3.69], PND [3.62], CC [3.52]. The number of positive comments for the three Options from the qualitative data set is relatively small and tends to be more or less evenly distributed (PND-57, CP-51, CC-35). Frequency counts of their respective negative comments are: PND-63, CP-45, CC-32.

24. **Hotel, Office and Residential Facilities:** The rank order of the average score for the three Options is: CP, CC, PND from the two quantitative data sets (if the flagged cases are excluded, the order is CP, PND, CC). The average score for the three Options in descending order is: CP [3.59], CC [3.55], PND [3.33] from the Exit Poll. CP has the highest frequency count (107) in terms of positive comments in the qualitative data set, followed by CC (69) and PND (31). Frequency counts of their respective negative comments are: CP-70, CC-100, PND-101. Preferred features for the CP Option include the small scale and concentrated development of the Hotel, Office and Residential Facilities.

25. **Connectivity[2]:** The rank order of the average score for the three Options is different from the two quantitative data sets. The average score in descending order from Exit Poll is CC [3.76], CP [3.69], PND [3.67]. The average score in descending order from Self-returned Questionnaire Survey is CP [3.77], PND [3.53], CC [3.51] (if the flagged cases are excluded, the order remains unchanged). In terms of positive

---

2. Question item Q1(f) "Connectivity with the Neighbouring Districts" of the questionnaire asks the respondents to indicate whether the concerned Conceptual Plan Option has addressed the connectivity issue raised on the planning of WKCD received in Stage 1 PE exercise. Question item Q2(B) "Connectivity" asks the respondents to indicate their degree of liking of the concerned Conceptual Plan Option on integration with neighbouring areas and relationship with Victoria Harbour.

comments from the qualitative data set, CC has the highest number (105), followed by PND (97) and CP (58). Frequency counts of their respective negative comments are: CC-30, PND-57, CP-49. Positive views on CC highlight its connectivity with nature, the harbour and neighbouring districts and the alignment of view axis in different street orientations.

26. **Accessibility:** The rank order of average score for the three Options is: CP, PND, CC from all quantitative data sets. The average score for the three Options in descending order is: CP [3.89], PND [3.75], CC [3.74] from the Exit Poll. In terms of positive comments, the number for CP (209) is only marginally higher than that for PND (207) and much higher that of CC (163). However, CP has much lower count of negative comments (76) when compared to that for PND (131) but higher than CC (54). Preferred features of CP include the underground roads, the rail system, the multi-entry concept, the broad reception area, and the separation of roads and car parks from footpaths.

27. The above results are summarised in the following table:

	Question	Self-Returned (Including Flagged Cases)	Self-Returned (Excluding Flagged Cases)	Exit Poll
Q.1 – Addressing the Main Concerns from Stage 1 PE Exercise				
(a)	Green Setting	CP[4.30], CC[3.48], PND[3.27]	CP[4.28], CC[3.49], PND[3.33]	CP[4.23], CC[3.66], PND[3.26]
(b)	Environmental Friendliness	CP[4.01], CC[3.45], PND[3.20]	CP[3.98], CC[3.50], PND[3.28]	CP[3.99], CC[3.59], PND[3.22]
(c)	Hong Kong's Uniqueness	PND[3.62], CC[3.40], CP[3.14]	PND[3.76], CC[3.47], CP[3.01]	PND[3.78], CC[3.61], CP[2.87]
(d)	Relax Atmosphere	CP[4.04], CC[3.47], PND[3.37]	CP[4.02], CC[3.56], PND[3.48]	CP[4.03], CC[3.74], PND[3.47]
(e)	Public Open Space	CP[4.03], CC[3.57], PND[3.55]	CP[4.01], CC[3.71], PND[3.68]	CP[4.02], CC[3.85], PND[3.68]
(f)	Connectivity with Neighbouring Districts *	CP[3.64], PND[3.60], CC[3.54]	PND[3.73], CC[3.66], CP[3.58]	PND[3.76], CC[3.75], CP[3.53]
(g)	Needs of Different Users *	CP[3.61], PND[3.51], CC[3.47]	PND[3.67], CC[3.60], CP[3.57]	CC[3.72], PND[3.68], CP[3.51]
Q.2a – Degree of Liking for Essential Features				
(i)	Open Space	CP[3.88], CC[3.49], PND[3.44]	CP[3.84], CC[3.57], PND[3.54]	CP[3.87], CC[3.77], PND[3.50]
(ii)	Core Arts and Cultural Facilities *	CP[3.70], PND[3.60], CC[3.53]	PND[3.72], CP[3.63], CC[3.62]	CC[3.79], PND[3.74], CP[3.55]
(iii)	Retail-dining-and-entertainment Facilities *	CP[3.74], PND[3.49], CC[3.42]	CP[3.69], PND[3.62], CC[3.52]	No significant difference
(iv)	Hotel, Office, and Residential Facilities *	CP[3.71], CC[3.55], PND[3.37]	CP[3.66], PND[3.48], CC[3.45]	CP[3.59], CC[3.55], PND[3.33]
Q.2b				
	Connectivity *	CP[3.77], PND[3.53], CC[3.51]	CP[3.72], PND[3.65], CC[3.61]	CC[3.76], CP[3.69], PND[3.67]
Q.2c				
	Accessibility	CP[3.93], PND[3.60], CC[3.55]	CP[3.90], PND[3.72], CC[3.64]	CP[3.89], PND[3.75], CC[3.74]

* Rank order is not the same for the 3 data sets. Figure inside [ ] indicate the average score for the respective CPO.

Phasing Arrangements

28. **The Phasing of the Core Arts and Cultural Facilities**: There is general support for Phase 1 and Phase 2 arrangements. Positive comments outnumber negative comments by a large margin (Phase 1 Positive Views-188; Negative Views-11; Phase 2 Positive Views-160, Negative Views-28).

Other Arts, Cultural and Education-related Facilities

29. **Other Arts, Cultural and Education-related Facilities:** The scores, from the Exit Poll and the Self-returned survey, are high for almost all of the other proposed arts, cultural and education-related facilities. This is corroborated by the mostly positive comments from the qualitative data set, even though the frequency count is low. Facilities receiving the top average scores from the Exit Poll include: School for Arts and Creative Industries (PND) [4.00], Community Art College (CC) [3.98], Film Centre (CC) [3.98], Knowledge Centre (CP) [3.97], Performing Arts Factory (PND) [3.96], and Art Organisation Workspace/International Cultural Establishment (CC) [3.96].

Other Views

30. **Overall Design:** CP received the highest number of positive comments (822), followed by PND (733), and CC (724). Frequency counts of their respective negative comments are: CP-706, PND-754, CC-549. Favourable comments on CP include the strong green environment, open space with a metropolitan feel, as exemplified by the Park and waterfront promenade.

31. **Most Preferred Features:** The green setting of CP is mentioned most (772) as the most preferred feature, followed by the accessibility provision of PND (750), and the physical provisions of CC (605), such as Harbour Pool, the Art Pontoons, the Suspension Bridge, etc.

32. **Other Suggested Facilities:** Facilities suggested by members of the public include literature museum (80), facilities for films (34), libraries (17), sports facilities (8), Chinese traditional culture museum (7), martial arts facilities (6), facilities for youth/elderly (4), collective memories area (3), acrobatics-magic-circus facilities (3), amusement facilities (3), etc.

33. **Other Issues:** Other issues raised receiving high number of comments include: arts and cultural programmes (315), design principles (309), WKCDA's management and operations issues (266), the strategic positioning of WKCD (224), and Hong Kong's cultural policy (182).

CONCLUSIONS

34.   The above results suggest that all of the CPOs, in general, received a high degree of support from respondents for almost all of the attributes. The three CPOs recorded an average score of over 3.0 out of 5.0 for almost all of the multiple choice questions in the questionnaire. As for the qualitative data, the distribution of positive and negative comments tends to be close for the three CPOs on many issues. For some issues, there are no clear indications of respondents' preferences. Given the above, the preferred Option for each attribute indicated in the following paragraphs often leads the other two by only a small margin in the average score. Nevertheless, the apparent small margin, in terms of the average score, for most of the questions, is statistically significant.

Addressing the Main Concerns from Stage 1 Public Engagement Exercise

35.   "City Park" is the preferred Option in terms of addressing public concerns regarding Exhibiting a Green Setting, Environmental Friendliness, Experiencing a Relaxing Atmosphere and Providing Public Open Space as well.

36.   "Project for a New Dimension" is the preferred Option in terms of showcasing Hong Kong's Unique Local and Traditional Characteristics.

37.   There is no clear indication as to which Option best addresses the public concerns regarding Connectivity with the Neighbourhood Districts and Catering the Needs of Different Users.

Degree of Liking for the Essential Features

38.   While "City Park" has the highest level of support in terms of its design for Providing Public Open Space, support for "Cultural Connect: Key to Sustained Vitality"'s design for this feature is considerable.

39.   While "Cultural Connect: Key to Sustained Vitality" has the highest level of support for its proposal as indicated by the Exit Poll for the Core Arts and Cultural Facilities, the proposals from "Project for a New Dimension" and "City Park" also have considerable support.

40.   For Retail, Dining and Entertainment Facilities, no single Option receives significantly more support than the other two.

41.   For Hotel, Office and Residential Facilities, "City Park" is the preferred Option.

42. There is no clear indication as to which Option is most preferred regarding Connectivity. "Cultural Connect: Key to Sustained Vitality" appears to have marginally more support.

43. "City Park" is the preferred Option in terms of Accessibility.

Phasing Arrangements

44. There is general support for the proposed phasing arrangements.

Other Arts, Cultural and Education-related Facilities

45. Most of the suggested Other Arts, Cultural and Education-related Facilities receive favourable support.

Other Views

46. The public engagement exercise, talent nurturing and audience building programmes, WKCD's overall design principles, as well as WKCDA's management and operations issues remain top concerns of the public.