

# **Consultation Panel of the West Kowloon Cultural District Authority**

---

## **Minutes of the 1<sup>st</sup> Meeting of the Consultation Panel of the West Kowloon Cultural District Authority**

Date: 27 May 2009 (Wednesday)

Time: 10:00 a.m.

Venue: Conference Room, Hong Kong Arts Development Council,  
14/F, East Warwick House, Taikoo Place,  
979 King's Road, Hong Kong

Present:

### Chairman

Professor CHEUNG Yan-leung, Stephen, J.P.

### Members

Hon. ARCULLI, Ronald G.B.S., J.P.

Mr. CHAN Ngok-pang, Ronald

Mr. CHENG Chi-ming

Mr. HO Hing-kay, Oscar

Mr. HUI Wah-kit, Michael

Mr. HUNG Chiu-wah

Ms. KO Po-ling, M.H., J.P.

Mr. KWAN Pak-hoo, Bankee

Ms. LAM Choi-chu, Ida

Hon. LEE Wing-tat

Dr. MAN Ying-ling

Mr. MOK, Charles Peter

Mr. TAI Hay-lap, B.B.S., J.P.

Hon. TSE Wai-chun, Paul

Dr. TSE Wing-ling, John, M.H.

Ms. WONG Ying-kay, Ada, J.P.

# **Consultation Panel of the West Kowloon Cultural District Authority**

---

## Representatives from the Government Departments

Mrs. YAU TSANG Ka-lai, Carrie, J.P. Permanent Secretary for  
Home Affairs  
Miss CHU Man-ling, Cathy, J.P. Deputy Secretary for  
Home Affairs  
(WKCD)  
Mr. LAU Kam-chuen, Danny Principal Assistant Secretary  
for Home Affairs (WKCD)

### ***(The following representatives from the government departments attended only the discussion of Agenda Item 1)***

Mr. SO Kam-shing, J.P. Deputy Secretary for  
Home Affairs (3)  
Ms. WONG Ching-yee, Jenny Principal Assistant Secretary  
for Home Affairs (Culture)1  
Mr. CHOW Tat-ming, Thomas, J.P. Director of Leisure and  
Cultural Services  
Mr. CHUNG Ling-hoi, J.P. Deputy Director of Leisure and  
Cultural Services (Culture)  
Ms. LIU Chiu-fun, Cynthia Assistant Director of Leisure and  
Cultural Services (Performing Arts)  
Dr. NG Chi-wa, Louis Assistant Director of Leisure and  
Cultural Services  
(Heritage & Museums)  
Dr. CHAN Ka-ki, Catherine Deputy Secretary for Education (5)  
Mr. LAI Chi-kin, Derek Assistant Secretary for Commerce  
and Economic Development  
(Communications & Technology)B2

## Representative from the West Kowloon Cultural District Authority

Mr. NG Wah-keung, Augustine Project Director

## Representatives from other organizations

*(attended only the discussion of Agenda Item 1)*

Mr. MA Fung-kwok Chairman of the Hong Kong  
Arts Development Council  
Mr. YU Kwok-lit, Louis Chief Executive of the Hong Kong

# Consultation Panel of the West Kowloon Cultural District Authority

---

Dr. HUEY, Herbert	Arts Development Council Associate Director (Administration) and Registrar of the Hong Kong Academy of Performing Arts
Ms. CHAN Chung-ying, Anna	Senior Lecturer (Performing Arts Education) of the Hong Kong Academy of Performing Arts

## Secretary:

Mr. FUNG Pan-chung, Chris	AS(West Kowloon Cultural District)1 HAB
---------------------------	--

## Absent with apologies:

Mr. LO Chung-wing, Victor, G.B.S., J.P.

Dr. ZEMAN, Allan, G.B.S., J.P

Mr. LEUNG Wing-cheung, William, J.P.

Dr. YAU Wing-kwong

## Action Parties

### **Opening Remarks**

The Chairman welcomed Members to the meeting and reported that Dr. Allan Zeman, Mr. Victor Lo, Mr. William Leung and Dr. W. K. Yau had sent apologies to the Secretariat for not being able to attend the meeting.

2. The Chairman said that the first item on the agenda was about arts and cultural software in Hong Kong. He welcomed the representatives of the Home Affairs Bureau (HAB), Education Bureau (EDB), Commerce and Economic Development Bureau (CEDB), Leisure and Cultural Services Department (LCSD), Hong Kong Academy for Performing Arts (HKAPA) and Hong Kong Arts Development Council (HKADC) to the meeting.

### **Agenda Item (1) - Arts and Cultural Software in Hong Kong (Consultation Panel Paper: WKCDA CP/01/2009)**

## **Consultation Panel of the West Kowloon Cultural District Authority**

---

Action  
Parties

3. The Chairman said that for the West Kowloon Cultural District (WKCD) to be developed into a world-class integrated arts and cultural district, programme planning and promotion, talent training and audience building are as important as the construction of arts and cultural facilities.

4. Mrs. Carrie YAU, Permanent Secretary for Home Affairs, thanked the Chairman and Members of the Consultation Panel for taking an interest in Hong Kong's arts and culture. She indicated that both arts and cultural education and rich programmes are crucial to arts and cultural development.

5. Mr SO Kam-shing, Deputy Secretary for Home Affairs (3), briefed the meeting on the status of Hong Kong's arts and cultural development, including capacity building, audience building, and arts education and manpower training. (Paper WKCDA CP/01/2009).

6. Dr. Herbert HUEY, Associate Director (Administration) and Registrar of the HKAPA, said that the HKAPA, with five schools under one roof, focused on training professional performers. But since 2004, the HKAPA had reformed its policy, and had been striving to bring arts education to the community and exploring how the HKAPA can partner with primary and secondary schools in enhancing the coherence of arts education.

7. Ms Anna CHAN, HKAPA Senior Lecturer (Performing Arts Education), said that the HKAPA established the Performing Arts Education Centre in 2007 to undertake two major areas of development. The first one was "outreach programmes". An example would be "Behind the Scenes", which was launched in 2005 in collaboration with the Hong Kong Jockey Club Charities Trust with approximately 4,000 primary and secondary students had been participating every year. In 2008, the Centre initiated another programme called the "smARTS Journey" to engage secondary students in the environment of the HKAPA. Under

## **Consultation Panel of the West Kowloon Cultural District Authority**

---

Action  
Parties

this programme, HKAPA students were also dispatched to different schools as “ambassadors”, thus promoting the integration of future artists into the community.

8. Ms. Anna CHAN said that “professional development” is another priority of the Centre. In collaboration with the EDB, the Centre offered two applied learning courses on dance and drama as well as regular short-term professional development courses for teachers. From time to time, the Centre would also organize free public lectures and forums for teachers and general public. An example would be the Forum on Performing Arts: Sharing Experiences The Royal Ballet, UK held in July 2008.

(Mr. MA Fung-kwok, Chairman of the HKADC, left the meeting at 10:30 a.m.)

9. Mr. Louis YU, Chief Executive of the HKADC, said that 10 out of 27 HKADC Members were representatives from the arts and cultural sector and all policies related to the HKADC would be discussed by the sector. Mr. Yu said that one of the priorities of the HKADC was to provide administrative support to small and medium sized arts groups. Starting from this year, the HKADC extended the committed grant period for small and medium sized arts groups from one year to two years, thus enabling them to make better arrangement for their development.

10. Mr. YU said that the HKADC organized the Arts Development Awards in 2008 to present various awards to local arts practitioners and arts groups in recognition of their contributions to arts development. The award also established a brand for local arts. The HKADC had also conducted annual surveys on arts related subjects. In addition, Mr. YU said that the HAB had sponsored the HKADC in sending local artists and arts administrators to take part in overseas advanced study and exchange programmes. The HKADC was currently in discussion with some foreign institutions’ Hong Kong offices about providing

## **Consultation Panel of the West Kowloon Cultural District Authority**

---

Action

Parties

overseas training to local participating artists.

11. Looking ahead, Mr. YU said that the HKADC would organize a one-month Hong Kong Dance Festival by the end of 2010. The festival would showcase Hong Kong artists' accomplishments on dancing. Moreover, the HKADC would liaise with local schools in order to implement the Arts Ambassador-in-school Scheme. It would also start teaming up with arts and cultural councils in various districts to launch the Enhanced Community Arts and Cultural Activities Programme.

12. The Chairman thanked the representatives from the HAB, HKAPA and HKADC for their presentations and invited members' views.

13. Mr. TAI Hay-lap said that the quality of arts education providers (such as teachers) and arts practitioners was very important and the key to ensure quality rested with the learning opportunities on pre-service, on-the-job and continuous education of these people. In this regard, he suggested the University Grants Committee (UGC) should increase the funding for professional development for arts and cultural learning and relevant applied research. He also proposed that the Government should discuss with the Heads of Universities Committee about setting up research and development centres in the universities to provide self-financing training courses for arts and cultural education providers. He said that the Government should co-ordinate the development of the HKAPA, Vocational Training Council, Hong Kong Institute of Vocational Education and Hong Kong Arts Centre. At the same time, the Government should explore whether tertiary education and arts and culture could become one of the pillar industries. Mr. TAI also proposed that the Government should help mobilize non-government resources to enhance multi-tier arts and cultural training for the youngsters.

## **Consultation Panel of the West Kowloon Cultural District Authority**

---

Action  
Parties

14. Mr. Ronald CHAN pointed out that District Councils could play a bigger role in promoting arts and cultural development. Whether or not the WKCD development would benefit district cultural and arts organizations warranted further discussion. He said that the Government should not give up on building district venues because of the WKCD development. Mr. CHAN was also pleased to note that the HKADC had started co-operating with arts and cultural councils in various districts.

(Hon. TSE Wai-chun, Paul left the meeting at 10:48 a.m.)

15. Ms. KO Po-ling was grateful that the presentations by the HAB, HKAPA and HKADC had shown her a clearer picture of Hong Kong's arts and cultural development. She said that the Government had to adjust existing policies and review the allocation of resources. Since District Councils could not single-handedly promote arts education, the Government should consider how resources could be effectively allocated to promote arts education in the community.

16. Hon. LEE Wing-tat expressed his worries that the future WKCD might not have enough audience. He asked if the upfront endowment of \$21.6 billion would be used solely for constructing facilities and whether the Authority would use part of it to promote the development of arts and cultural software. He also agreed that we should step up arts and cultural education. The example he cited was that a student would rather spend money on pop concerts than visiting painting exhibitions. He considered that the Government should enhance talent training and support for young artists. He added that what young artists needed the most might not be financial support but space for them to display their works.

17. Mr. HUNG Chiu-wah said that the Government had in fact spent a great deal of resources on arts and cultural bodies over the past few years. However, he suggested that the Government

## **Consultation Panel of the West Kowloon Cultural District Authority**

---

Action  
Parties

should enhance its support for music and Cantonese opera playwriting. He believed that creative and novel programmes would help build a new audience, thereby ensuring Cantonese opera's continuous development.

18. Ms. Ada WONG suggested the Government to set up a special unit to co-ordinate the development of arts and cultural software for the next five years. She said that there were still a lot of gaps in audience building and arts education. She suggested that the Government should identify these gaps by conducting researches. For instance, she pointed out the Hong Kong Arts Festival attracted a total attendance of 110,000 every year, but the number of people who attended the festival was estimated to be less than 50,000 people. The figure was not much of an improvement over the previous years, proving our inadequacy in audience building. She pointed out that the allocation of government resources was unsatisfactory. Most of the resources went to the "Big 9 Arts Groups", leaving only small amount of resources for small and medium sized arts groups. Besides, it would take a long time for all the students to have a chance to take part in the arts ambassador scheme and culture day activities initiated by the Government. She also said that we currently did not have enough arts administration courses. She reiterated that the Government had to set up a special unit to formulate a five-year plan for arts and cultural development.

19. Mr. Oscar HO said that arts research was lacking in Hong Kong and arts criticism was weak, too. He pointed out that Hong Kong must develop arts research in support of arts education and provide young artists with a platform, otherwise the development of arts and culture would be incomplete. He was also concerned about the "professionalism" of future WKCD staff. He pointed out that M+ was billed as a museum of contemporary arts, which was a deep subject. Even if the Authority sent its staff to existing museums for training, they might not learn useful knowledge about running a contemporary arts museum. He also reminded



## **Consultation Panel of the West Kowloon Cultural District Authority**

### Action

### Parties

---

the Government and the Authority to take into account the local factors in cultural management and the professional assessment of arts activities. Mr. Oscar Ho stated that seeking specific comments from the public on the architectural design of M+ was inappropriate, for the design of venue is determined by the artistic and curatorial directions of the institutions. He also pointed out that the success of WKCD depends heavily on identifying a distinctive cultural niche for Hong Kong. Such identification requires academic and intellectual research and articulation.

20. Dr. John TSE said that students nowadays were not so keen on arts activities. Therefore, cultural development should focus on changing Hong Kong people's living culture. He said that participation was very important and it was not enough to be an audience on the sidelines. He also emphasized that the UGC and universities have an important role to play in promoting arts and culture. If the universities did not regard arts development as a priority, there would be a problem.

21. Ms. Ida LAM said that at present, the resources available to the development of arts for persons with disabilities were not enough. Since the development of arts for disabled persons was still in its infancy, she was concerned that it might be marginalized as the development of mainstream arts and culture proceed at a rapid pace, resulting in a "disparity between the rich and the poor". She said that 6% of the Hong Kong population are people with disabilities, so it was imperative for the Government to deal with this issue. She also said that the promotion of arts for persons with disabilities could bring in a new group of audience. Statistics suggested that each person with disability participating in arts and cultural programmes was accompanied by three to five caretakers, making them an audience group with great potential and would contribute to the development of WKCD in the long run. She also encouraged the Government and arts groups to offer special assistance to people with disabilities so that they could attend and participate in arts and cultural performances.

## **Consultation Panel of the West Kowloon Cultural District Authority**

---

Action  
Parties

22. Mr. Bankee KWAN suggested that under the new “3-3-4” academic structure, more resources should be allocated to the development of liberal studies in order to develop students' interests and provide related training.

23. Hon. Ronald ARCULLI pointed out that the WKCDA Board (the Board) had discussed at previous meetings the development of arts and culture and the formulation of a plan for the next few years. He understood that the public had high expectation of the Authority, but they should not ignore what the Government was doing. The Authority would continue to discuss in detail with the Government on the development of arts and culture. He emphasized that the WKCD development would be “people-oriented”.

24. Mrs. Carrie YAU thanked Members for their views. She also appreciated Members' concerns over resources, support and policies. She said that the HAB would continue to strive for the necessary resources, create a talent pool and attract overseas talents. She pointed out that the establishment of this Consultation Panel was written into the law, which was a testimony to the “bottom up approach” of the WKCD development. She also emphasized the importance of seeking the views of the public.

25. Ms. Ada WONG asked the Consultation Panel to follow up with the Government on the timetable for the establishment of a special unit. The Chairman said that the Consultation Panel will follow up with the Government. [**Post-meeting Note:** The Government will set up a steering group led by the HAB and CEDB later this year to coordinate work of inter-departments and relevant organisations (e.g. HKADC and HKAPA etc.) on promotion of cultural development in Hong Kong.]

26. With no more comments from the Members, the Chairman closed the discussion of this agenda item.

## **Consultation Panel of the West Kowloon Cultural District Authority**

---

### **Agenda Item (2) - Brief Summary of Previous Consultation Exercises on the West Kowloon Cultural District Development (Consultation Panel Paper: WKCDA CP/02/2009)**

27. Members noted the contents of paper (WKCDA CP/02/2009).

### **Agenda Item (3) - Situation Update on the West Kowloon Cultural District Project (Consultation Panel Paper: WKCDA CP/03/2009)**

28. Mr. Augustine NG, Project Director of the Authority, presented paper (WKCDA CP/03/2009) and supplementary information.

29. Hon. Ronald ARCULLI reminded the Members that the seven planning design principles outlined in the paper were by no means cast in stone. The Authority welcomed comments from the public. He also pointed out that these planning design principles had already taken into account the needs of people with disabilities.

30. Hon. LEE Wing-tat agreed that the connectivity of the WKCD with the neighbouring districts was very important. He explained that if the neighbouring districts were not properly connected to the WKCD, they would not be able to integrate with the WKCD. Mr. HUNG Chiu-wah expressed similar concern over the connectivity of the WKCD and the surrounding areas.

31. Ms. Ada WONG pointed out that the WKCD development should not focus on artistic consumption; artistic production was equally important. She proposed that arts colleges and small arts villages should be set up in the WKCD. She also said that to avoid cutting off the WKCD, the Authority should take the connectivity of the WKCD with surrounding areas seriously. She

## **Consultation Panel of the West Kowloon Cultural District Authority**

---

Action  
Parties

also stressed that all open spaces in the WKCD must be provided at the ground level, instead of on rooftop.

32. Mr. Ronald CHAN suggested adding “technology” as one of the planning design principles, because technology exerted a profound influence on the development of arts and culture.

33. Ms. KO Po-ling also said that the Authority should carefully consider the connectivity of WKCD with the neighbouring districts, as well as the integration of the old and new districts. In particular, she suggested that the Authority should explore how the WKCD can be connected to the areas around Shanghai Street and Canton Road.

34. Hon. Ronald ARCULLI said that during the preparation of the Development Plan (DP) of the WKCD, the Project Consultant and Conceptual Plan Consultants would attend public engagement activities to gauge the views of the public. If Members found any inadequacies in the Conceptual Plan Options, they could express their views.

35. With no more comments from the Members, the Chairman closed the discussion of this agenda item.

(Mr. HUI Wah-kit, left the meeting at 11:50 a.m.)

### **Agenda Item (4) - Proposed Arrangements for Stage 1 Public Engagement Exercise (Consultation Panel Paper: WKCDA CP/04/2009)**

36. The Chairman said that the Authority had earlier announced that the public engagement (PE) exercise for the preparation of the DP would be conducted in three stages. He encouraged all Members to take part in the first stage PE exercise.

## **Consultation Panel of the West Kowloon Cultural District Authority**

Action  
Parties

---

37. Mr. Augustine NG presented paper (WKCDA CP/04/2009).

38. Dr. MAN Ying-ling proposed to add the following to the draft list of institutions/stakeholders who can be considered for inviting to take part in the Stage 1 PE exercise: All parent-teacher associations, principals' associations of primary schools, secondary schools and kindergartens, and teaching education institutions for primary, secondary and kindergarten teachers from all 18 districts of Hong Kong.

39. Ms. Ada WONG pointed out that the Authority must take positions on many issues in the impending consultation. It was not advisable to conduct an open consultation without taking any position. She said that it was improper to consult the public again as to whether there should be education facilities or cloakrooms in the venues at this stage. She pointed out that currently the most pressing task was to recruit arts professionals for M+ because these professionals would have their own ideas about the artistic direction and vision of M+. The Authority should first identify the positioning of the arts and cultural facilities before proceeding with the consultation exercise, or risk giving public the impression that the Authority was unsure of its own direction. In addition, Ms. Wong asked if the Authority was going to have 180 PE activities spanning the three stages of PE exercise. She was worried that too many PE activities would result in consultation fatigue among the public.

40. Miss Cathy CHU, Deputy Secretary for Home Affairs (WKCD), said that Stage 1 PE would have questions different from those asked in the previous consultations. Stage 1 PE would focus on the overall planning of the WKCD. There were two sets of questions proposed for the latest consultation. The first set included questions about general planning matters because in addition to arts and cultural facilities, the WKCD would also provide a lot of open spaces and the Authority must take into

## **Consultation Panel of the West Kowloon Cultural District Authority**

---

Action  
Parties

account the views of the public. The second set included questions about facilities inside the arts and cultural venues and targeted users of these venues. Nevertheless, the users would not be responsible for designing any of the facilities. On the contrary, their views would form the basis of public opinions for the reference of the performing arts and museum professionals recruited by the Authority.

41. Mr. Ronald CHAN suggested adding members of the technology sector to the draft list of institutions/stakeholders. He also suggested that the LCSD should include in all the house programmes a copy of the consultation document and collection box should be installed at various LCSD venues, such as the City Hall, to collect the views of the public. In addition, he said that effective dissemination of information was very important. He suggested that the Authority should consider handing out background information about the WKCD to tourists and to update the Authority's website in a timely fashion.

42. Mr. Charles Peter MOK said that it was critical to devise standardised questions for the consultation. If different people were allowed to ask questions in a different way during the consultation, it would be impossible to collect the necessary views. As for the modes of communication, he thought that website alone was not enough. He suggested making use of Facebook and online discussion forums, as well as uploading video clips to the Youtube. He also pointed out that, if technically feasible, the Authority should consider broadcasting PE activities online or posting questions on the Internet to gather feedback. These initiatives would demonstrate that the Authority attached great importance to technology.

43. Mr. CHENG Chi-ming considered that the Authority should handle the public consultation with due care. He said that it was a good idea to set up online discussion forums but there should be specific pointers to guide the discussion so as to

## **Consultation Panel of the West Kowloon Cultural District Authority**

Action

Parties

---

prevent it from being too vague and general.

44. Hon. Ronald ARCULLI responded that this time around, the Authority did not start the consultation with a clean sheet of paper. The Authority would make reference to the results of the previous consultations.

(Mr. CHENG Chi-ming left the meeting at 12:22 p.m.)

45. Mr. HUNG Chiu-wah suggested adding representatives of ethnic minorities to the draft list of institutions/stakeholders in order to incorporate different cultural elements.

46. Ms. KO Po-ling said that how to arouse the public's interest in the PE activities and engage them in a structured discussion were two important issues to consider. She also suggested holding workshops as one of the formats for PE activities.

47. Hon. LEE Wing-tat said that open-ended questions should be avoided during the PE fora. Only by asking focused questions could fruitful discussions be triggered. He also suggested the Authority to upload the consultation document to its website to prepare the public for the PE exercise.

(Ms. KO Po-ling and Mr. HUNG Chiu-wah left the meeting at 12:30 p.m.)

48. Mr. TAI Hay-lap said that end of July was not a good time for holding the first PE activity because summer holiday would have started by then. He suggested that it would be more appropriate to have the first PE activity held in early July or at the end of September. He also agreed with the idea of seeking public's views on the WKCD through online discussion.

49. Mr. Oscar HO said that the Authority should not focus

## **Consultation Panel of the West Kowloon Cultural District Authority**

---

Action  
Parties

completely on the technical aspects of the WKCD development. He pointed out that matters that have to invoke “professional considerations” should be left to the arts professionals. He said that to make the WKCD a success, the Authority has to consider the positioning of the WKCD in the region. As for the contents of the consultation questions, he thought that the questions in paragraph 7 of the paper had carried too much details, and therefore not suitable for discussion. Mr. HO also proposed that the Authority should consult the representatives of various university departments, including anthropology, cultural studies, sociology and arts history.

50. Ms. Ida LAM asked if there was a way for Members to submit their views regarding the proposed arrangements of the Stage 1 PE exercise after the meeting.

Secretariat of  
the  
Consultation  
Panel

51. The Chairman replied that Members could submit additional views regarding the proposed arrangements of the Stage 1 PE exercise to the Secretariat within two weeks after the meeting. (**Post-meeting Note:** The Secretariat sent all Members of the Consultation Panel a letter on 1 June 2009 to solicit additional views regarding the proposed arrangements of the Stage 1 PE exercise. As at 11 June 2009, the Secretariat had received submissions from 7 Members.)

52. With no more comments from the Members, the Chairman closed the discussion of this agenda item.

### **Agenda Item (5) - Any Other Business**

Secretariat of  
the  
Consultation  
Panel

53. Dr. John TSE agreed that ground rules should be established for the Consultation Panel meetings, but he found the tone of rule no.3 could be improved. He suggested the Authority to consider revising the wording.



## **Consultation Panel of the West Kowloon Cultural District Authority**

---

54. There being no further business, the meeting was adjourned at 12:38 p.m. The next meeting was tentatively scheduled for end June/early July 2009.

**The Secretariat of the Consultation Panel of the West Kowloon  
Cultural District Authority  
July 2009**